Protocol for Review of Instructional Materials for ELLs

WIDA PRIME Correlation
Introduction
The Protocol for Review of Instructional Materials for ELLs (PRIME) has been developed by World-Class Instructional Design and Assessment (WIDA) to assist educators and publishers in examining the representation of key elements of the WIDA English language proficiency standards in their materials.

The intent of this review is for users to identify the ways in which elements of the *WIDA English Language Proficiency Standards, 2007 Edition, PreKindergarten through Grade 12* are represented in instructional materials. These materials vary from core or supplemental texts to DVDs to software programs; however, it is assumed that they all seek to provide teachers with standards-based references to use with English language learners in diverse settings across the United States.

The *Protocol for Review of Instructional Materials for ELLs (PRIME)* is not an evaluative tool aimed to judge the effectiveness of published materials using the WIDA English Language Proficiency (ELP) Standards. The goal of the Protocol for Review of Instructional Materials for ELLs (PRIME) is twofold:

• to assist educators in making informed decisions in selecting instructional materials for programs serving English language learners and
• to aid publishers and correlators in developing materials and communicating how their materials address key elements of the WIDA English Language Proficiency Standards

Organization
The Protocol for Review of Instructional Materials for ELLs (PRIME) is organized into two parts that together are intended to provide information about instructional materials in each of 14 criteria. Part 1 contains information about the materials that are to be reviewed. Part 2 is the protocol used for the review of instructional materials and includes space for page number examples and responses to the questions. An Appendix at the end of the document provides definitions of the categories included in the PRIME correlation.

Please note that the questions contained in this form are identical to those in the completed correlations on our website.

Directions for completing the Protocol for Review of Instructional Materials for ELLs (PRIME) inventory:

**STEP 1:** Complete information about materials being reviewed.
**STEP 2:** Respond to the “Yes/No” questions about the presence of the criteria in the materials.
**STEP 3:** Provide justification to support your “Yes” responses. (Note: If additional explanation for “No” answers is relevant to readers’ understanding of the materials, this may also be included.)
Organization of the WIDA English Language Proficiency Standards In Relation to the Protocol for Review of Instructional Materials for ELLs

The 14 PRIME criteria are in **BOLD** below.

I. Performance Definitions
   (Criteria that shape the ELP Standards)
   - IA. Linguistic Complexity
   - IB. Vocabulary Usage
   - IC. Language Control/Conventions

II. English Language Proficiency Standards
   - IIA. Presence of WIDA ELP Standards
   - IIB. Representation of Language Domains
     (Listening, Speaking, Reading, Writing)

III. Levels of English Language Proficiency
    (Entering, Beginning, Developing, Expanding, Bridging)
    - IIIA. Differentiation of Language
    - IIIB. Scaffolding Language Development

IV. Strands of Model Performance Indicators
   - IVA. Language Functions
     - Attached to Context
     - Higher Order Thinking
   - IVB. Content Stem
     - Coverage and Specificity of Example Topics
     - Accessibility to Grade Level Content
   - IVC. Instructional Supports
     - Sensory Support
     - Graphic Support
     - Interactive Support
Part 1: Information About Materials

Publication Title(s): Discussions4Learning

Publisher: Davis Publications

Materials/Program to be Reviewed: Discussion4Learning Levels A-D

Tools of Instruction included in this review: Levels A-D

Intended Teacher Audiences: Classroom teachers, content specialists, language teachers, resource teachers, and paraprofessionals

Intended Student Audiences: Applicable to all grades and all ages school age and above

WIDA Framework(s) considered: Summative and Formative

Language domains addressed in material: Listening, Speaking, Reading, and Writing

WIDA English Language Proficiency Standards addressed: Social and Instructional, Language Arts, Science, Social Studies, and Mathematics

WIDA language proficiency levels included: Levels 1-5

Most Recently Published Edition or Website: www.discussions4learning.com

In the space below explain the focus or intended use of the materials.

Discussions4Learning is designed to develop oral language and high-level academic vocabulary through discussions of digitally projected fine art images and real-world photos. Each lesson takes just 20–30 minutes.

The focus of each lesson includes the introduction of 4-6 high-level, academic vocabulary words. Each vocabulary word is introduced in a context sentence that helps students acquire standard academic English syntax through oral discussions rather than through worksheets or vocabulary lists. The images include fine art fine art images from around the world and across time. Alternating lessons include a related photo from around the world and across the USA.

The program includes suggested scripts to help teachers continue to review previous vocabulary words weeks and months after they were introduced through authentic contexts.

The program is organized by themes that are intended to connect to important concepts in Science and Social Studies across the grade levels.

Each lesson deliberately includes questions for all levels of students, from simple yes or no or either-or questions to much more challenging open-ended discussion questions.

The lessons also include support for teachers to develop academically productive discussions, with tips throughout each lesson on ways to involve all students, and to increase students' ability to learn to listen to each other and build on what their classmates have said.
Part 2: PRIME Correlation Tool

I. PERFORMANCE DEFINITIONS

IA. Linguistic Complexity (the amount and quality of speech or writing)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YES</th>
<th>NO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>✔</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A. Do the instructional materials take into account linguistic complexity for language learners?

B. Do the instructional materials address linguistic complexity for all of the targeted proficiency levels?

C. Is linguistic complexity systematically addressed, in multiple lessons, chapters, or units, in the materials?

Justification: In the box below provide examples from materials as evidence to support each “yes” response for this section. Provide descriptions, not just page numbers.

A. The Discussions4Learning program is a leveled vocabulary program that presents opportunities for learners to practice linguistic complexity at the word, phrase, and sentence level in all lessons. The program focuses on oral language which allows all students, no matter their proficiency level, to participate and learn new vocabulary in an authentic context. Students are taught vocabulary through the observation and discussion of fine art and photographic images that include a large range of contexts and cross-curricular content. Lessons are carefully scripted to guide the discussions and integrate vocabulary instruction. Each lesson follows a supportive multi-tiered question design. Questions range in complexity from simple “yes and no” or “either-or” forced choice questions to open ended discussion questions. Advanced students are encouraged to respond to more challenging questions using complete sentences supported with evidence. Additional linguistic supports are found within the sidebar features in the TE and address specific leveled needs. For example, when the word VERDANT is introduced teachers are suggested to ask students about the Spanish word for green- verde- as a connection.

B. Discussions4Learning is a leveled program that addresses linguistic complexity appropriately for all the targeted proficiency levels. Level A teaches 4 new vocabulary words per lesson and Levels B-D teach 6 words. Context sentences get slightly longer and more complex throughout the levels as well as within each level. Instructional scaffolds are found within each lesson and include cooperative learning, sensory rich activities, tiered questioning, and repetition. The TE also includes side bar features that include repetition and discussion tips and language frames to assist teachers needs in the classroom.

C. Linguistic complexity is systematically addressed in all levels, themes, and lessons throughout the Discussions4Learning program. All lessons are scripted and follow the same format throughout the levels. Example citations throughout this correlation will be taken from Level C. View the following representative examples of linguistic complexity practice in Theme 1, Week 1, Lesson 3 "Domino Players" by Horace Pippen, page 8:

The artist represented his own family in this painting. Who can say that with me?
What colors did the artist use to represent the people’s clothing?
What other kinds of interactions might take place in this kitchen?
IB. Vocabulary Usage (specificity of words, from general to specific to technical)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YES</th>
<th>NO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>☑</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A. Is vocabulary usage represented as words, phrases, and expressions in context?

B. Is vocabulary usage addressed in the materials for all of the targeted levels of proficiency?

C. Are general, specific, and technical language usage systematically presented throughout the materials?

Justification: In the box below provide examples from materials as evidence to support each “yes” response for this section. Provide descriptions, not just page numbers.

A. The core objective of Discussions4Learning is to learn and use content-rich academic vocabulary in authentic contexts. The 4-6 high-level vocabulary words presented in each lesson are beyond what students read and hear in everyday life. They are sophisticated words like element, precarious, contour, intricate, fabricate, and transform and most are not found on typical academic word lists (See the theory on pages 22-28 in the Program Guide). Vocabulary is introduced within the context of the looking and talking about the art work, and is used as a word, in a phrase, in expressions, within sentences, and in whole group discussion. Student friendly language is used to define the term, and repetition is encouraged throughout the lesson. View an example discussion found in Theme 1, Week 1, Lesson 2 page 6: “This room has a SERENE mood. Who can say that with me? (student repetition of word) If you are floating on a serene lake, is it a peaceful lake, or a lake full of action? (Answer is a phrase/expression). “ Lessons also include open-ended questions that require students to internalize the word and use it in an opinion statement with evidence. In addition, a feature in the TE called Vocabulary Tips provides suggestions for teachers to expand vocabulary beyond the core lessons including ways to use words in various syntactic structures to facilitate retention, work with synonyms, sentence frames to facilitate discussion, and activities like acting out the meaning of the words.

B. The Discussions4Learning principle is that by focusing on oral language all students can participate in learning and using vocabulary. Appropriate instructional scaffolds are built into each lesson to assist all targeted levels of learners. These include but are not limited to teacher modeled and guided discussions, cooperative learning, and multi-tiered questioning. Advanced learners are challenged with the sophisticated vocabulary presented in each lesson as well as the cross-curricular content and regular opportunities to engage in higher-order thinking.

C. Each lesson presents 4-6 new vocabulary words as well as the review and practice of previously learned words. The core lesson is structured systematically to introduce the new word in context, ensure that all students use the word orally, use the word in guided discussions, revisit previously learned vocabulary, and lessons end with an informal assessment of students’ ability to understand target words. This structure is used throughout the levels within every lesson. View the systematic process in the example Lesson in Theme 1, Week 2, Lesson 3 “Balancing Act” pages 18-19. The vocabulary words balanced, precarious, balancing act, portrait, self-portrait, and absurd are highlighted the first time they are presented to the students. View the range of questions, the ease of the materials, and the ample content connections available in the TE for each lesson.
IC. Language Control/Conventions (comprehensibility of language)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YES</th>
<th>NO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>☑️</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑️</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑️</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A. Are opportunities to demonstrate language control presented in the materials?

B. Do opportunities to demonstrate language control correspond to all targeted levels of language proficiency?

C. Are opportunities to demonstrate language control systematically presented in the materials in multiple chapters, lessons, or units?

Justification: In the box below provide examples from materials as evidence to support each “yes” response for this section. Provide descriptions, not just page numbers.

A. Each lesson in Discussions4Learning presents constant opportunities for students to practice and demonstrate language control at the sentence level. The lesson scripts use guided tiered questioning that allow for single word, short phrase, and full sentence responses that require supportive evidence. Questions that necessitate sentence level answers are found in every element of the lesson and are often open-ended and involve personal response. Examples of scripted questions in Theme 1 are "What do you think this invention is used for? Why do you think the artist invented it (page 38)?" and "What might be some of the advantages and disadvantages of this device?" (page 38)?" Within the review section of the lesson, vocabulary is often presented using social and everyday language. An example review question is "Keri used a stapler to fasten together two sheets of paper. Did she use a device, or a structure (page 39)?" Lessons contain at least one noun, one verb, and usually adjectives and adverbs to develop student skill in acquiring different parts of speech. View the Scope and Sequence in any level on pages 30-37 to view vocabulary and the different parts of speech represented in each lesson. In addition, the Vocabulary Tips feature provides additional suggestions for teachers to expand lessons with activities that use the words in a range of syntactic structures.

B. Guided discussions include additional support for students at lower proficiency levels like example language frames, explanations, repetition, and consistent review. Discussion prompts help to elicit a fuller response like "Say more about that" and "Why do you think so?" For advanced students, the open ended discussions encourage critical thinking and listening skills. Regular opportunities to compare and contrast images and connect content across the curriculum engage linguistically advanced students in every lesson.

C. The program focus is on oral language development, and is implemented into the classroom 20 minute lessons daily. Therefore each time a teacher includes a lesson in Discussions4Learning into the school day, they provide an opportunity for students to practice and demonstrate language control. See the following representative examples of questions that elicit sentence level responses in Theme 1, Week 6, Lesson 1 pages 54-55:

1. Suppose that you wanted to make this a contemporary scene. How would you change it? Would you call the mood of this portrait bustling, serene, scary, or something else? Would you call this a realistic portrait? Why or why not?
II. ENGLISH LANGUAGE PROFICIENCY (ELP) STANDARDS

IIA. Presence of WIDA English Language Proficiency Standards

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YES</th>
<th>NO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>☑</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A. Are social and instructional language and one or more of the remaining WIDA Standards (the language of Language Arts, of Mathematics, of Science, and of Social Studies) present in the materials?

B. Do the materials systematically integrate Social and Instructional Language and the language of the targeted content area(s)?

Justification: In the box below provide examples from materials as evidence to support each “yes” response for this section. Provide descriptions, not just page numbers.

A. The WIDA Standards of Social and Instructional Language, Language Arts, Mathematics, Science, and Social Studies are all present in the Discussions4Learning program. Content within the fine art and real-world photos connect to science, social studies and math topics. These connections are made during the guided discussions and are found within the accessory notes in the TE. The TE presents these connections at the beginning of the week’s lessons in the feature Information for the Teacher as well as in the lesson side bars. The language of Language Arts is found in every lesson as students practice skills such as looking for the main idea and details of an image, make an inference, and use evidence to support a statement. Vocabulary includes nouns, verbs, adjectives, and adverbs to develop language using different parts of speech. See the Scope and Sequence in the Program Guide on pages 30-37 to view the representation of WIDA standards in the program and a list of vocabulary arranged by noun, verb, adverb/adjective, and expression. View representative examples of the WIDA Standards in Theme 2: Language Arts: Week 10, Lesson 2 on pages 96-97. The vocabulary word is SETTING. The teacher explains that setting is an element of stories as well as visual representations. Students then describe the setting of a story they know. Mathematics: Week 11, Lessons 1-2 on pages 103-107: The language of mathematics is represented as students practice and apply the terms OVAL, CURVATURE, CROSS SECTION, POSITIONED, CHAMBER, SUCCESSIVE, RADIATE, SPIRAL. On page 103, the Fibonacci Sequence is introduced. Science: Week 8, Lessons 1-4 pages 73-81: The content of these lessons focuses on insects and animals. Representative science vocabulary terms include ADAPTED, TRAITS, HERBIVORE, PREDATORS, and MAMMALS. Lessons discuss topics like environments, habitats, predation, and animal features. Social Studies: Week 9, Lessons 1-2 pages 84-87: The language of social studies is found within most lessons in the FYI features and other informational features that give historical and cultural background (See p. 83 Information for the Teacher). Images include a large range of ancient and contemporary images, as well as images from across the globe representing numerous cultures. These two lessons represent examples of the wide range of social studies content present in the program. B. The program practices social language within each lesson as students learn to interact productively and listen attentively to participate in academic whole group discussions. The guided discussions and thought provoking questions instruct and support student language development throughout the program. Each lesson includes an oral review to assess student understanding of new vocabulary.
IIB. Representation of Language Domains

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YES</th>
<th>NO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>☑</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- A. Are the language domains (listening, speaking, reading, and writing) targeted in the materials?
- B. Are the targeted language domains presented within the context of language proficiency levels?
- C. Are the targeted language domains systematically integrated throughout the materials?

Justification: In the box below provide examples from materials as evidence to support each “yes” response for this section. Provide descriptions, not just page numbers.

A. The core lessons in Disussions4Learning target the oral language domains of listening and speaking but the program lends itself to reading and writing connections. The program teaches listening and speaking skills by creating an atmosphere of academic and productive talk. The scripted lessons require students to listen and respond, and teachers do not evaluate answers as correct or incorrect. Students listen to each other, demonstrate their listening skills by restating classmate and teacher responses, and have the opportunity to agree/disagree and give their personal response. They are required to evaluate peer responses and use evidence to support their own response. Reading skills such as finding the main idea and details, inference, and citing evidence are practiced in every lesson. Teachers can extend the lessons with writing activities that incorporate the vocabulary words. Word cards are available on the website, www.discussions4learning.com, and can be used in reading and writing activities after the main lesson.

B. Discussions4Learning is a leveled program that contains embedded supports that assist all targeted levels of learners to participate in the discussion and learn the academic vocabulary. Supports like questioning techniques, a range of question types, whole group discussions, and wait time allowance are presented in every lesson. In the TE, guided discussion tips support a variety of situations in the classroom. Tips include but are not limited to encouraging students to speculate, prompting students, restatement of student ideas, and using background knowledge.

C. Oral language is targeted in each lesson systematically as students look, listen, and respond to the fine art or photographic image. Teachers follow a scripted lesson that guides student response and teaches 4-6 words per lesson. In the TE, lessons are broken up into 3 sections that practice oral language: Observe and Discuss the Image, Connecting to the Theme, and Quick Question Review. The first two sections use the image directly in a whole group discussion that teaches the vocabulary words. The third section reviews and evaluates student knowledge of the terms with social language or language unrelated to the images. An example review question in Theme 2 page 89 is “Hannah threw newspapers into a recycling bin. Did she DISCARD them, or did she DISPLAY them?” View any lesson in the TE to see the systematic presentation of listening and speaking activities.
III. LEVELS OF LANGUAGE PROFICIENCY

IIIA. Differentiation of Language (for ELP levels)

YES NO
☑ ☐ A. Do the materials differentiate between the language proficiency levels?
☑ ☐ B. Is differentiation of language proficiency developmentally and linguistically appropriate for the designated language levels?
☑ ☐ C. Is differentiation of language systematically addressed throughout the materials?

Justification: In the box below provide examples from materials as evidence to support each “yes” response for this section. Provide descriptions, not just page numbers.

A. Discussions4Learning is a four level program- Levels A-D. Each level contains four teacher's guides organized by theme, a Program Guide, and a CD ROM with the fine art and photographic images used in the lessons. Levels are broken down into 4 themes and each theme includes 6 weeks of lessons with 4 lessons in each week. The levels are targeted to grade levels K-6 to prepare grade school students for middle and high school academics. Level A presents 4 vocabulary terms in each lesson. The scripted language is not complicated and uses simple sentences and sensory rich support activities. Example sentences in Level A include "The cookie jar was CERAMIC" or "The trucks are METALLIC." Levels B-D teach 6 words per lesson and language progressively becomes more dense, rich, and complex. An example sentence in Level D is "The painting depicts the great MIGRATION of African Americans from rural locales to urban destinations." The sentences include only one new word and the other challenging vocabulary is previously learned vocabulary. Teachers can view a list of vocabulary and example sentences on the website to determine which level would be appropriate for their classroom. The levels are not sequential, making it possible to use any level without needing to start at the beginning level.

B. Levels A-D provide appropriate developmental and linguistic differentiation for all of the WIDA proficiency levels. The program is designed to provide opportunities for students at all proficiency levels to participate, learn, and be appropriately challenged. This is accomplished through the authentic communication created by viewing and discussing fine art images in a range of contexts and contents. Students learn grammar and syntax naturally in this cooperative learning atmosphere. All lessons contain scaffolds like guided discussion, language frames, repetition, and visual/sensory/interactive supports.

C. Differentiation of language is systematically addressed throughout the program. In each level, language becomes increasingly complex as new vocabulary is introduced and older terms are reviewed and inserted into new lessons. But as students advance through the lessons, communicating about fine art and participating in an academic discussion becomes more comfortable and natural. View the increasingly complex vocabulary and objectives in the Scope and Sequence of any level's Program Guide on pages 30-38.
IIIB. Scaffolding Language Development (from ELP level to ELP level)

YES  NO

☐  ☐  A. Do the materials provide scaffolding supports for students to advance within a proficiency level?

☐  ☐  B. Do the materials provide scaffolding supports for students to progress from one proficiency level to the next?

☐  ☐  C. Are scaffolding supports presented systematically throughout the materials?

Justification: In the box below provide examples from materials as evidence to support each “yes” response for this section. Provide descriptions, not just page numbers.

A. Discussions4Learning is an oral language program in which all students can participate regardless of proficiency level. Students productively listen and speak with advanced vocabulary in a highly scaffolded discussion that supports student advancement within their proficiency levels. The scripted lessons include questions in a range of difficulty, including simple yes or no questions to open-ended inquiries that require complete sentences and evidence to support student response. Lessons encourage students to listen carefully to and repeat new vocabulary in context while encouraging them to find the meanings of the new words on their own using semantic meaning and contexts. Lessons also build in repetition of previously learned vocabulary words. The TE provides background information, further explanations to define terms, language frames, and connections to content areas like math, science, and social studies to deepen understanding of content and new vocabulary.

B. Discussions4Learning provides supports to advance students from one proficiency to the next through consistent participation in supported academic discussions. The vocabulary taught in the program is advanced and cross-curricular giving students the opportunity to participate in higher level discussions in any content area and every day life. The language frames and questioning strategies allow students to use progressively more advanced language as they move through the lessons. Advanced students are challenged to use more complex language when answering open-ended questions, making connections to cross-curricular content, and in the regular opportunities to compare and contrast images.

C. Supports are systematically built into each level, theme, and lesson throughout the program. See the following representative examples of the type of scaffolds found within each level.

Theme 2, Week 12, pages 114-121:
Information for the Teacher page 113: A wealth of background information is presented at the beginning of each thematic group of lessons.
Scripted and Guided Discussions, All Lessons: Each lesson is scripted with a range of question types for all student participation. From questions like "Are all these horses adults (p. 114)?" that require yes or no answers to open-ended questions that necessitate personal responses like "What events can evoke happy feelings (p. 119)?"
Vocabulary Review page 119: Past vocabulary is reviewed regularly.
Repetition, All Lessons: View a representative example on page 114 in which the teacher says "These are newborn foals. Can you say that?" The Repetition Tip features located in the side bar on page 114 break down the sentences into phrases for repetition.
IV. STRANDS OF MODEL PERFORMANCE INDICATORS

IVA. Language Functions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YES</th>
<th>NO</th>
<th>Context</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>☑</td>
<td></td>
<td>A. Do the materials include a range of language functions?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑</td>
<td></td>
<td>B. Do the language functions attach to a context (i.e. are they incorporated into a communicative goal or activity)?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑</td>
<td></td>
<td>C. Are language functions presented comprehensively to support the progression of language development?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Justification: In the box below provide examples from materials as evidence to support each “yes” response for this section. Provide descriptions, not just page numbers.

A. Discussions4Learning includes a range of language functions within the instructional language as well as in the vocabulary taught in every lesson. In the scripted lessons teachers ask questions that use language functions such as describe, develop, identify, observe, and express. The instructional language in the TE includes objectives and side bar features that use language functions regularly. These language functions include but are not limited to repeat, discuss, focus, eliminate, review, speculate, and distinguish. The vocabulary words presented in each lesson also include higher-level language functions. Representative examples of language functions found in the vocabulary across the levels include assemble, design, depict, elaborate, focus, format, generate, interpret, scrutinize, verify, and visualize. In addition to the inclusion of WIDA defined language functions, the program focuses on the practice and application of new language and how it functions in context. Each lesson teaches academic vocabulary in an authentic context, and students practice and apply the new language repeatedly throughout the program.

B. Language functions found within the program are always attached to a language development activity. See representative examples in Theme 2, Week 9:

Examples found in instructional language-
"EXPLAIN that certain holidays pay tribute to important people in our history (p. 85)."
"What do you OBSERVE in this photograph (page 86)?"
"Have the class SPECULATE on what might happen if fungi did not consume trees and leaves that fell down in the forest (page 91)."

Examples found within the presentation of academic vocabulary:
"The monarchs CONVEY gifts to their monarch (p. 85)."

C. Language functions permeate the instructional language and are found throughout the academic vocabulary presented in the program. The examples presented in part B represent the type of language found in each lesson. In the Program Guides view the list of vocabulary that includes higher-level language functions in each level on pages 58-59 as well as on the website www.discussions4learning.com.
**Higher Order Thinking**

**D.** Are opportunities to engage in higher order thinking present for students of various levels of English language proficiency?

- ✔

**E.** Are opportunities for engaging in higher order thinking systematically addressed in the materials?

- ✔

Justification: In the box below provide examples from materials as evidence to support each “yes” response for this section. Provide descriptions, not just page numbers.

---

**D.** Opportunities for higher-order thinking are presented in each lesson for learners of all targeted levels. The guided evaluation of the fine art and photographic images are the backbone of each lesson. Each lesson includes 1-3 guided discussions that are open-ended opportunities. These discussions encourage students to think critically and to listen to each other and give careful responses with evidence to support what they say. Discussions also include opportunities for students to evaluate peer responses for agreement or disagreement for students of lower proficiency levels. The content of the images are cross-curricular and the program helps students to make connections between the images and a large range of content and concepts that include science, math, social studies, and history. Comparing and contrasting is built into the lessons at regular intervals. Each fine art image is paired with a real-world photo with a similar theme which allows students to compare and contrast the content of both images. In addition, students are often asked to recall earlier images and compare and contrast new images with the previously viewed images and concepts.

**E.** As stated in part D, opportunities to engage in higher-order thinking are systematically embedded in each lesson. These include discussions with open-ended questions, analyzing and evaluation of images and peer responses, compare and contrast, and cross-curricular content connections. See the following representative examples in Theme 3, Week 15, Lesson 3, Frank Lloyd Wright "Kaufmann House" pages 148-149:

**Open-Ended Question:**
Why might it be nice to integrate a waterway into a building’s design?

**Evaluation:**
Is this a typical design for a house? Why or why not?

**Compare Images:**
How is this innovative structure similar to the one we saw with the rooftop garden?

**Response to Peer Ideas (Guided Discussion Tip #1):**
Jamila mentioned the waterfall. What is special about the waterfall?

**Connection to History (Teacher Tip):**
Many critics decided it was a structural mistake... In 2001, the Kaufmann house was renovated, and some of its structural problems were addressed.
IVB. Content Stem

YES NO Coverage and Specificity of Example Content Topics

☑ ☐ A. Do examples cover a wide range of topics typically found in state and local academic content standards?

☑ ☐ B. Are example topics accessible to English language learners of the targeted level(s) of English language proficiency?

☑ ☐ C. Are example topics systematically presented throughout the materials?

Justification: In the box below provide examples from materials as evidence to support each “yes” response for this section. Provide descriptions, not just page numbers.

A. Discussions4Learning covers a wide range of topics found in the Common Core State Standards for English Language Arts. The key areas of the CCSS most thoroughly practiced in the program are the Speaking and Listening Standards, Reading Standards for Literature, and the Reading Standards for Informational Text. An explanation on how the program correlates to the CCSS and correlations can be found in the Program Guide on pages 41-57 of any level or online at www.discussions4learning.com. The art works and photographs chosen for Discussion4Learning present a range of topics with cross-curricular content. Topics include connections to science, social studies, history, math, and language arts. Additionally, the program presents a balance of images from an array of cultures and environments all around the world. The questioning strategies are designed to spark background knowledge as well as guide students to new information. Side bar features such as Information For The Teacher and About, present information on the artist, contextual background information for the artist and the work, and more insights and content connections to expand content in each lesson.

B. Topics are made accessible to English Language Learners and other targeted proficiency levels through embedded supports such as cooperative learning and guided questioning. The program is highly interactive and each lesson topic is supported with engaging graphic and sensory supports making topics accessible for all targeted levels. The questioning techniques require every pupil response, and utilize multiple question types from short answer to open-ended.

C. Levels, themes, and lessons are presented systematically throughout the program. Lessons are organized under themes, and there are 4 themes in each level. The program themes across all levels are Things We See and Use, Our Living World, Places and Spaces, and Our Changing World. Each lesson includes 4 sections: introduce the image, observe and discuss the image, connect to the theme, and a quick question review. Content connections are presented through discussion and additional content is provided in the TE. To view the range of topics presented in any level, view the Scope and Sequence on pages 30-39 in the Program Guide.
Accessibility to Grade Level Content

D. Is linguistically and developmentally appropriate grade level content present in the materials?

E. Is grade level content accessible for the targeted levels of language proficiency?

F. Is the grade level content systematically presented throughout the materials?

Justification: In the box below provide examples from materials as evidence to support each “yes” response for this section. Provide descriptions, not just page numbers.

D. The Discussions4Learning program is targeted to grades K-6 to establish a strong language foundation to prepare students for middle and high school academics, but can be used at all grade levels. The content of the fine art and images and the high-level vocabulary used throughout the program creates a flexible curriculum appropriate for a range of grade levels. The fine art images presented are appropriate for any age or grade level and include artists like Pablo Picasso, John Singer Sargent, and Paul Klee. The art and photos are related to themes that are taught repeatedly throughout the grade levels. These themes include Things We See and Use (relates to matter and objects), Places and Spaces (relates to biomes and habitats), Our Changing World (relates to science and social studies topics like weather and communities), and Our Living World (relates to flora and fauna). As stated previously, the vocabulary words presented in each lesson are high-level and are not likely to be in a child’s vocabulary in a given grade range. These are words that students will most likely encounter in higher level texts or may hear in other contexts. For example, vocabulary terms taught in Level C include cylindrical, multitude, bustling, luxurious, and fabricate. View the Contents of any level on pages 4-5 in the Program Guide. The Scope and Sequence on pages 30-37 includes the weekly objectives and a full listing of vocabulary.

E. Grade level content is made accessible to the targeted levels of language proficiency through guided and scripted lessons and embedded instructional supports found throughout the program. The scripted discussions include repetition, student friendly definitions and explanations, and a range of question types. Questions range from yes or no answer, short answer, to open-ended questions that require students to evaluate peer responses and use evidence. The TE includes side bars that include background information, discussion and repetition tips, and cross content connections to support all targeted learners.

F. Content and topics are presented systematically throughout the levels, themes, and lessons. Each lesson in the program contains four sections: Introduce the Image, Observe and Discuss the Image, Connecting to the Theme, and Quick Question Review. Teachers present the fine art or photographic image and lead the students through a discussion that discovers the content of the image and introduces the new vocabulary. Vocabulary terms are presented in the same manner in each lesson using context and repetition with a student friendly definition. See a representative example lesson in Theme 3, Week 13, Lesson 1 pages 124-125. Each lesson is organized in this systematic manner throughout every level.
IVC. INSTRUCTIONAL SUPPORTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YES</th>
<th>NO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>☑</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A. Are sensory supports, which may include visual supports, present and varied in the materials?

B. Are sensory supports relevant to concept attainment and presented in a manner that reinforces communicative goals for the targeted levels of proficiency?

C. Are sensory supports systematically presented throughout the materials?

Justification: In the box below provide examples from materials as evidence to support each “yes” response for this section. Provide descriptions, not just page numbers.

A. Discussions4Learning presents varied sensory supports throughout the program. Lessons revolve around the viewing and discussing of fine art and photographic images. As stated in previous sections, these images include a large range of content and represent assorted time periods and cultures from around the globe. A fine art image is paired with a photograph so that students can compare and contrast similar thematic content and make connections to the real world. Whole class discussions encourage cooperative learning and are supported with tiered questioning to involve the entire class no matter the student's proficiency level. Lessons are scripted using guided questioning that allows discovery and deepens interest in the image content and new vocabulary. Side bars in the TE often encourage the use of additional sensory supports. For example in Theme 2 on page 114, students use a blindfold to distinguish scents that the teacher prepares like coffee, vinegar, or an onion. This helps students to understand the content of the lesson that introduces how all animals discern and enjoy the smell of their babies, represented in the painting by Susan Rothenburg of a horse smelling her newborn foal.

B. Sensory supports used within the program reinforce communication and language acquisition objectives of the lesson. The cooperative discussions in all lessons teach responsive listening and speaking skills that support oral language development. Scripted lessons use scaffolds such as wait time allowance and use language appropriate for the targeted proficiency levels. Sensory supports like these allow each lesson to have a low threshold for entry and give every student an opportunity to participate.

C. Sensory supports are presented systematically in every level, theme, and lesson. See the following examples in representative lessons in Theme 4, Week 20 pages 194-201:
- Observe and Discuss the Image page 194, 196, 198, 200: Students view the image and in a guided whole class discussion discover content and practice new vocabulary.
- Listening and Speaking Supports pages 194-195: After teachers ask a question, words marked in blue give the teacher additional explanations if needed and reminds the teacher to allow for response wait time.
- Vocabulary: Collapse page 194 (in the sidebar): Students demonstrate COLLAPSE by acting out the word. Teachers say instructional sentences like "Margo, collapse into the reading corner rug."
- Teacher Tip page 197: Teachers can demonstrate the word BUOYANT by providing objects for students to drop in a basin of water. With every dropped object the teacher asks "Is this object buoyant? How do you know?"
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YES</th>
<th>NO</th>
<th>Graphic Support</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>☑</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>D. Are graphic supports present and varied in the materials?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>E. Are graphic supports relevant to concept attainment and presented in a manner that reinforces communicative goals for the targeted proficiency levels?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☑</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>F. Are graphic supports systematically presented throughout the materials?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Justification: In the box below provide examples from materials as evidence to support each “yes” response for this section. Provide descriptions, not just page numbers.

D. Works of fine art and real-world photographs are the graphic supports and the foundation of learning the academic vocabulary. The images have been chosen for their visual impact, thought-provoking content, and appeal to students. They represent a diverse range of cultures and environments throughout the world. For example, students will experience art from Mexico, Japan, Brazil, Greece, Iraq, and Russia in many types of mediums from sculpture and painting to weavings and dolls. The images represent ancient cultures as well as contemporary life. Subjects and activities in the images may be familiar to some students but not familiar to others allowing peer teaching opportunities. Example activities in level C include boat making, playing cricket and dominoes, shoeing a horse, and commuting in a city. The two types of images work to reinforce each other within the ongoing theme. For example, an abstract Chagall painting that includes a cow is complimented with a photograph of a cow in a crowded alley in India. The photograph helps to show the students how the abstraction is rooted in what the artist sees in everyday life, which then relates to the theme. This support aids the discussion process, inviting more academic and sophisticated responses, therefore helping the practice and application of new words.

E. The art works and photographs are directly related to the academic content and theme of the lesson. Most classroom discussion revolves around the observing of the image and relating it to the new words. This serves to support and reinforce the oral communicative goals of the lesson and program.

F. In all levels and themes, each week presents 2 works of fine art and 2 real-world photographs to support the teaching of 4-6 words per image. Each level includes a CD organized with high quality reproductions, and the images are also reproduced within the TE lessons. The TE also includes discussion tips beyond the lesson scripts, information on the artist, and connections to content areas. The program makes it easy for any teacher, with or without an art background, to guide discovery discussions about the image and teach new vocabulary.
WIDA Protocol for Review of Instructional Materials for ELLs
WIDA PRIME Correlation Form for Educators

YES  NO  Interactive Support
☑️  ☐  G. Are interactive supports present and varied in the materials?
☑️  ☐  H. Are interactive supports present and relevant to concept attainment for the targeted proficiency levels?
☑️  ☐  I. Are interactive supports varied and systematically presented in the materials?

Justification: In the box below provide examples from materials as evidence to support each “yes” response for this section. Provide descriptions, not just page numbers.

G. Discussions4Learning is a highly interactive program that involves the entire class in engaging academic discussions. Students are encouraged to relate topics to background knowledge and share their knowledge with the entire class. Because image content is so varied, this gives a wide arena for students of differing backgrounds to provide personal expertise in multiple lessons throughout the year. Lessons begin with simple observational questions regarding the content of the picture like "What do you observe in the background?" The lessons then develop as students are introduced to the new vocabulary and given more background information on the artist and cross-curricular connections. Questions that are open ended or require opinions are asked regularly like "Would you call the mood in this photograph buoyant, or mournful? Why?" This development within every lesson creates an interactive atmosphere in which every student can participate. Additionally, teachers use hand gestures (example, page 200), modeling, sensory tools, small group activities, and other interactive demonstrations to deepen understanding of vocabulary regularly. These demonstrations are either embedded into the scripted lesson or found within the TE sidebar features.

H. The interactive supports utilized in every lesson of Discussions4Learning assist students of all proficiency levels to participate in the discussions and learn new vocabulary. As stated in part G, scripted and tiered questioning support learners of all levels. The focus on oral communication helps to level the playing field in the classroom, giving students phonics and spelling free time to communicate with their peers and teachers.

I. Every theme and lesson is presented in a systematic design that utilizes interactive supports throughout every level. The entire 20 minute lesson is interactive, requiring discussion and thoughtful responses from every student. Images are introduced at the beginning of each lesson. The image content is then explored and discussed while new vocabulary is introduced and practiced. Interactive activities that deepen understanding are found within the side bars of the TE and embedded into the discussion notes. View the following examples of interactive tips in Theme 4:
Teacher Tip page 200: Teachers are encouraged to present a sentence in sign language.
Vocabulary: Mimic page 201: Students mimic actions of their classmates like jumping.
Vocabulary: Draw page 219: The teacher demonstrates DRAW by bringing a chair toward him/her and pushing it away in a cycle. The teacher says "I'm pushing the chair away, and now I'm drawing it toward me."
Appendix

I. **Performance Definitions** – the criteria (linguistic complexity, vocabulary usage, and language control) that shape each of the six levels of English language proficiency that frame the English language proficiency standards.

   IA. **Linguistic Complexity** – the amount and quality of speech or writing for a given situation

   IB. **Vocabulary Usage** – the specificity of words (from general to technical) or phrases for a given context

   IC. **Language Control/Conventions** – the comprehensibility and understandability of the communication for a given context

II. **English Language Proficiency Standards** – the language expectations of English language learners at the end of their English language acquisition journey across the language domains, the four main subdivisions of language.

   IIA. **Five WIDA ELP Standards:**
   1. English language learners communicate for Social and Instructional purposes within the school setting.
   2. English language learners communicate information, ideas, and concepts necessary for academic success in the content area of Language Arts.
   3. English language learners communicate information, ideas, and concepts necessary for academic success in the content area of Mathematics.
   4. English language learners communicate information, ideas, and concepts necessary for academic success in the content area of Science.
   5. English language learners communicate information, ideas, and concepts necessary for academic success in the content area of Social Studies.

   IIB. **Domains:**
   - **Listening** – process, understand, interpret, and evaluate spoken language in a variety of situations
   - **Speaking** – engage in oral communication in a variety of situations for a variety of audiences
   - **Reading** – process, understand, interpret, and evaluate written language, symbols and text with understanding and fluency
   - **Writing** – engage in written communication in a variety of situations for a variety of audiences

III. **Levels of English Language Proficiency** - The five language proficiency levels (1-Entering, 2-Beginning, 3-Developing, 4-Expanding, 5- Bridging) outline the progression of language development in the acquisition of English. The organization of the standards into strands of Model Performance Indicators (MPs) illustrates the continuum of language development.

   IIIA. **Differentiation** – providing instruction in a variety of ways to meet the educational needs of students at different proficiency levels

   IIIIB. **Scaffolding** – building on already acquired skills and knowledge from level to level of language proficiency based on increased linguistic complexity, vocabulary usage, and language control through the use of supports.
IV. Strands of Model Performance Indicators – examples that describe a specific level of English language proficiency for a language domain. Each Model Performance Indicator has three elements: Language Function, Content Stem, and Support

IVA. Language Functions – the first of the three elements in model performance indicators indicates how ELLs are to process and use language to demonstrate their English language proficiency.
- Context – the extent to which language functions are presented comprehensively, socially and academically in materials
- Higher Order Thinking – cognitive processing that involves learning complex skills such as critical thinking and problem solving.

IVB. Content Stem – the second element relates the context or backdrop for language interaction within the classroom. The language focus for the content may be social, instructional or academic depending on the standard.

IVC. Instructional Support – instructional strategies or tools used to assist students in accessing content necessary for classroom understanding or communication and to help construct meaning from oral or written language. Three categories of instructional supports include sensory, graphic and interactive supports.
- Sensory support – A type of scaffold that facilitates students’ deeper understanding of language or access to meaning through the visual or other senses.
- Graphic support – A type of scaffold to help students demonstrate their understanding of ideas and concepts without having to depend on or produce complex and sustained discourse.
- Interactive support – A type of scaffold to help students communicate and facilitate their access to content, such as working in pairs or groups to confirm prior knowledge, using their native language to clarify, or incorporating technology into classroom activities.